

**FINAL GRANTEE PROJECT EVALUATION/SITE VISIT REPORT
CBA PILOT PROJECT-PIMS 3508**

Introduction

The CBA programme is supporting the implementation of between 8 and 20 community-based adaptation projects, designed to enhance the adaptive capacity to climate change of participating communities, in each of ten countries (Bangladesh, Bolivia, Guatemala, Jamaica, Kazakhstan, Morocco, Namibia, Niger, Samoa, and Vietnam). In order to ensure cost-effectiveness, projects are implemented in areas that are particularly vulnerable to climate change including variability, and where there is high potential to secure global environmental benefits in the context of climate change. Projects like this one under review, emerges from each of the focal areas [biodiversity, land degradation, coastal zone management, etc] depending on local context, specific vulnerability and adaptation analysis in each of the selected sites within the countries. To achieve the objective of this project and in line with the overall CBA programme, all activities discussed during evaluation should provide clear inputs to the three overall outcomes at the global levels. These are:

- (i) Enhanced adaptive capacity allows communities to reduce their vulnerability to adverse impacts of future climate hazards
- (ii) National policies and programmes designed to include community adaptation priorities to promote replication, up-scaling and mainstreaming of best practices
- (iii) Cooperation among member countries promoted for innovation in the design and implementation of adaptation to climate change including variability projects and policies.

SECTION A: Project Details

1.0 Name of Project: Adaptation to the growing climate aridization through the climatically sustainable pastoral management arrangements

2.0 Project Number: CBA/KAZ/SPA/09/02

3.0 Project Start Date: April 2009

Project End/Termination Date: December 2011

4.0. No. of Project Extensions If Any: The project had one extension, from 1 May to 31 December. The reason of extension was the refinement of final project reports by the project executing party and the opportunity of money transfer to the grantee's account.

SECTION B: ORIGINAL PROJECT INFORMATION:

5.0. Project Goal, objectives, expected outputs and sustainability plans:

Project goal is to reduce the impact of aridization induced by the climate change by planting haloxylon and improving the resources of pastoral and inundable lands

Project Objectives:

- ✚ To test the new technologies on inundable hayfield management by accumulating moisture and improving their productivity for the purposes of cattle farming of the local community members through the increased yields of forage for winter and reduced cattle grazing;
- ✚ To enhance the pastoral sustainability by establishing haloxylon plantations under the growing aridization conditions;
- ✚ Dissemination of the project experience to be replicated by the other local communities.

Expected Outcomes:

The project activities were in accordance with the approved plan. The goals of this Agreement have been fully met. The following outcomes that speak for success of the project activities have been gained through the project, for the period from March 2009 to February 2011:

✚ Haloxylon has been planted on the planned territory (containing 70ha). The plantation has shown a high germinating capacity as a result of the proper planting technique and favorable climate conditions in 2008 and 2009. By autumn 2010 the seedlings reached 40-70cm in height;

✚ The haloxylon nursery has been established covering 1ha; the works have also been performed to encourage the natural regeneration.

✚ As a result of the project activities, the vegetation of fertilizer-treated inundable lands was 30cm higher in 2009 and 2010 compared to the other hayfields where the nitrate fertilizer was not used. The fertilizer-treated hayfields produced 2.7 times more hay compared to the same area of untreated inundable lands. The fertilizer-treated fields had high after-grass that was used for grazing until the snowfall.

✚ In 2009 and 2010 the project site was exposed to the pastoral productivity assessment and the technology of seasonal use of pastures for the community cattle grazing needs has been practiced with the herdsman. The sustainable pastoral management has been developed through the project on the territory of 4900ha.

As required by the CBA Program, three workshops on the vulnerability reduction assessment have been organized by the project involving the local community members of Mukan Tolebayev village.

SECTION C: METHODOLOGY (*Describe the innovative methods/systems/strategies used in the project and a listing of name of participants/organisations in this process*):

The project has implemented a number of adaptation technologies as follows:

The plantation of haloxylon on degraded lands enabled to improve the density of vegetation cover, contribute to the moisture accumulation in soil, consolidation of sand drifts and restoration of the desert pastoral ecosystem. In the near future those are expected to be the high-productivity pastoral lands.

Over 70ha of degraded pastures were planted with haloxylon within the project. Haloxylon nursery was established covering 1ha; this will enable to continue the expansion of restored pastures.

The retention of snow and the use of fertilizers at the inundable hayfields demonstrated a simple and easily applicable method to improve the yields of hay and enabled the rural inhabitants to increase the quantity of fodder, extend the non-grazing time and reduce the pressure on pastures in early spring.

With the use of fertilizers the hay yields of the inundable meadows were 3 times higher compared to the similar area of those where fertilizers were not applied. Such method is of special relevance given the existing conditions of growing draughts, reduced precipitation and the drop of water level in the Lepsy River.

Seasonal use of remote pastures. The local community jointly with the rural district administration have organized the distant grazing of the community herd at the remote pastures located 20-30km from the village to reduce the degradation processes of the near-village rangelands.

The project involved Public Foundation Revival, Smerdin LLP, the local community of Mukan Tulebayev village, GIZ, and Burlutobinsk State Forestry Management Office.

4.0 The table

Objectives	Findings on Activities and strategies Implemented	Lessons learned and Challenges Encountered	Tools and Products developed
<p>M+E performed previously</p> <p>The monitoring of project activities and the vulnerability reduction assessment (VRA) have been performed on the dates as follows: 25.11.2008 – VRA-1; 25-26.07.2009 and 26-27.08.2009 – project monitoring in line with the indicators; 30.05.2010 – VRA-2 24.03.2011 – VRA-3</p>	<p>The project monitoring covering the project duration from 2009 to 2011 has shown that the project objectives have been fully met with good outcomes gained.</p> <p>Haloxylon was planted on the territory of 70ha. The seedlings are developing well and will ensure the high-productivity grazing lands for the nearest 3-5 years.</p> <p>The local community members have been trained in the method of enhancing the productivity of inundable hayfields and the distant grazing technology.</p> <p>The monitoring of project activities, interviews with the village inhabitants and the vulnerability reduction assessment exercises have shown that the implemented adaptation methods such as fertilizer treatment of inundable hayfields, haloxylon plantations and seasonal use of pastures have reduced the vulnerability of the village inhabitants to the growing climate aridity.</p> <p>The strategy adopted by the project is to improve the fodder base of cattle farming under the growing climate aridity conditions. The methods implemented by the project address the problem of sustainable cattle farming. The project is a demonstrational one and the methods of</p>	<p>The rotation of pastoral lands enabled to mitigate the climate aridization.</p> <p>The following two agreements have been reached under the project: the agreement of radical pastoral improvement by haloxylon plantation reached with the Forestry Management Office and the agreement of allotment of the remote rangelands to the local community members made with the akimat. The project has also addressed the issues relating to the community herd formation, hire and training of herdsmen.</p> <p>In future the project will have to break a number of barriers such as driving the main cattle stock from the near-village pastures to the remote rangelands.</p> <p>The project approach built on the traditional knowledge of Kazakh people is simple by nature whilst being an efficient method and showed the easy ways of reducing the local community's vulnerability to the climate</p>	<p>The project tools and deliverables:</p> <p>The following events have been organized in 2009: meetings with the local community members; the Field Day was held on the inundable field maintained by E. Smerdina, the local community member; two project monitoring exercises held on 25-26 July, 26-28 August (SGP GEF staff members and experts involved); the training workshop held on 4-7 May at the haloxylon plantations with involvement of the Youth Club (25 persons).</p> <p>The following events have been organized in 2010: meetings, Field Days, demonstrational workshop, project monitoring involving UNDP Office staff and GIZ representatives.</p> <p>The events organized in 2011: the demonstrational presentation workshop held on 25 March in Taldykorgan attended by the local community members of M. Tolebayev village, SGP GEF representatives, Farmer of Kazakhstan Foundation, TGS Wiedergeburt Public Association, Youth Center Arai PA.</p> <p>The materials published:</p>

	<p>developing the fodder base for cattle farming are easily replicable in the desert areas under the support of Forestry management Offices, akimats and rural inhabitants to ensure the sustainable development of the livelihood traditional for Kazakh people i.e. cattle farming.</p>	<p>changes.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Information Bulletin on the climate change; - The brochure «Haloxylon» describing the project goals, objectives and outcomes along with the climate changes on the project sites and the reduction of vulnerability of the local community to the climate change by the re-establishment of haloxylon forests; seasonal pasture rotation; enhancement of productivity of the inundable hayfields (Published in March 2011). <p>The project manager presented the project by radio and at the meetings of the district and oblast levels.</p> <p>The project-related information was published in the newspapers, magazines and the other mass media.</p>
<p>Training and Capacity building of grantees and communities</p>	<p>The project executing parties were actively involved in the training organized for the local community members of M. Tolebayev village in the rules and methods of sustainable pastoral management.</p> <p>The main goal was to ensure maximal coverage of inhabitants to make them aware of the potential climate change risks, adaptation methods and demonstrate specific methods implemented by the project that would enhance the adaptation capacity of the local community members of M. Tulebayev village.</p>	<p>Arai Youth Center PA of the neighboring village Lepsy provided a considerable support to the project grantees in organizing the seasonal distant grazing of the cattle maintained by the local community of M. Tolebayev village.</p> <p>Challenges encountered: the village is quite remote; cattle-farming is the main livelihood. Poverty and inactivity of inhabitants are among the main</p>	<p>The local community's capacity building and their active involvement in the adaptation activities are encouraged by the Field Days held on the project site, demonstration of cost-efficiency of the methods implemented by the project, publication and dissemination of the information leaflets, brochures, show of the video film and the grantees' presentations in mass media.</p>

	In addition, the direct involvement of local community in the project activities enabled to considerably enhance the local community's capacities in addressing the problems of livelihood and implementing the complex projects.	barriers to expanding the project activities.	
Community mobilization	The project startup was rather difficult. The local inhabitants were somewhat passive and showed distrust. But owing to the joint activities of the two NGO's and the local initiative group as well as the results attained after the first year of the project the perception of local inhabitants changed. The local inhabitants tended to consolidate their efforts and showed the willingness to collaborate and meet the goals set by the project.	<p>The meeting was held with Mr. Setzhapar Kasymbekov, the akim of the rural district which jurisdiction included the villages named after M. Tolebayev, Ulga and Krasny Rybak whereby the agreement was reached on the akimat's support of the project activities.</p> <p>The main lesson learned by the project was the necessity of continuous awareness of the local community members of the project results; demonstration of the project activities and local community involvement in the project monitoring exercise.</p>	<p>The community mobilization tools were as follows: the general meetings, discussions, Field Days, dissemination of information about the project results, specifically those relating to economic indicators of rising the wellbeing of the project participants.</p> <p>An effective tool was to involve the nearest rural NGO's in the project activities. The involvement of Arai Youth Center has strengthened the LC's capacities and contributed to the successful completion of Objectives 2 and 3.</p>
How project promoted or impacted policy	The project strategy was to implement the methods of fodder base enhancement under the growing climate aridity conditions. The project activities were focused on the sustainable cattle farming development: restoration of haloxylon forests, productivity enhancement of inundable	<p>The project was a demonstrational site to show the technology of inundable hayfields productivity enhancement and revive the haloxylon pastures.</p> <p>The project manager, and experts presented the project activities and outcomes at the</p>	An important LC capacity building component is to train them in the adaptation methods. The grantees were actively working to raise the awareness of the local inhabitants of M. Tolebayev village and the nearest villages of the climate changes and the risks faced by the pastoral cattle farming, the

	<p>hayfields and the method of traditional seasonal use of pastures. Such approach has improved the adaptation of local community to the climate change.</p> <p>This and the other SGP GEF projects in the field of sustainable pastoral management were the basis to develop Kazakhstan's national pastoral restoration program elaborated by the Ministry of Agriculture of the Republic of Kazakhstan.</p>	<p>oblast and republican workshops, meetings and round tables (Astana, Almaty, Takdykorgan etc.).</p> <p>The problem encountered was the lack of governmental support of the grazing cattle farming and the lack of financial resources on the level of local authorities that have been made responsible for the pastoral management.</p>	<p>adaptation methods in order to reduce vulnerability of the local community members under the growing climate aridity conditions.</p> <p>Demonstration of the method of hay crop improvement of inundable hayfields encouraged its application by the other local community members.</p> <p>To overcome the barriers constraining to the implementation of the methods applied in the project the project experience needs to be promoted further in mass media along with the awareness activities among the district authorities.</p>
<p>Other important activities of Project</p>	<p>The participatory video method was applied to make the video film that is shown in the villages.</p> <p>The experience of this project on the reduction of the climate change impact on grazing cattle farming is broadly promoted and disseminated in the regions where it can be applicable (i.e. in the areas with similar ecosystems and social-economic conditions)</p>	<p>The approaches and methods proposed by the project are understandable thus making the basis for the project expansion and its further replication.</p>	<p>A lot of work is dedicated to explain the benefits of the methods as applied within the project to the village inhabitants. The emphasis is on the demonstration of the economic benefit. The animals' weight is measured and the cattle productivity is analyzed for distant and near-village grazing, according to hay crop yield at the fertilizer-treated inundable fields vs untreated fields.</p>

SECTION D: Environmental Benefits

5.0 Summary of the VRA/IAS, Volunteerism Activities and interpretation of the data/information in the M+E table

Item Description	Supportive Narrative Information and or Data		
	First/Initial	Second/Mid term	Third/Final
<p>Results of the Vulnerability Reduction Assessment</p> <p>There were 3 vulnerability reduction assessment workshops conducted in Mukan Tolebayev village. The participants were asked 4 indicator questions as follows:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • How serious is the current impact of draught (reduction in precipitation, the rise of summer temperature etc.) on your livelihood? • How serious will be the impact of further growth of the climate aridity on your livelihood with the existing agricultural practices? • Give an assessment of the obstructions constraining to your implementation of the climate change risk mitigation activities? • Give an assessment of your capabilities and willingness to support the project activities? <p>The scores were assigned by the participants based on a five-grade scale, where 5 means heavy impact and 0 denotes low impact. The analysis of scores assigned by the workshop participants has shown the trends as described below.</p> <p><u>Question 1.</u> Both in the beginning and the middle of the project the local inhabitants assigned a high score to the impact of the climate change observed on the project site.</p> <p>It follows from the scores assigned that the local community members have assessed the climate change impact through the perspective of the project results: the climate change risks can be mitigated though the adaptation method proposed by the project.</p> <p>The local community members have realized that the project outcomes such as productivity enhancement of the cattle grazed on the remote high-productivity pastures; increase in the hay yields on the fertilizer-treated inundable lands; free time available for the local inhabitants permitting to be engaged in the other activities etc. Help them to become less dependent on the climate change risks.</p>	<p>VRA workshop was held on 25 November 2008</p> <p>Question 1: score 4,6</p> <p>Question 2: score 5,0</p> <p>Question 3: score 4,6</p> <p>Question 4: score 1,2</p>	<p>VRA workshop was held on 30 May 2010</p> <p>Question 1: score 4,67</p> <p>Question 2: score 4,78</p> <p>Question 3: score 4,44</p> <p>Question 4: score 2,89</p>	<p>VRA workshop was held on 24 March 2011</p> <p>Question 1: score 3,07</p> <p>Question 2: score 3,93</p> <p>Question 3: score 3,64</p> <p>Question 4: score 3,86</p>

<p><u>Question 2:</u> In 2008 the further climate change impact on the local community's livelihood was evaluated at the maximum score (5). The reduction of the score down to 3,98 by the end of the project indicates that the local community members, having recognized the growing climate impact on the land farming techniques, saw the positive results of the project activities. The village inhabitants believe that the methods proposed by the project would facilitate the improvement of their livelihood under the growing climate aridity conditions.</p> <p><u>Question 3:</u> The assessment of barriers constraining the adaptation to the climate change risks has also dropped from 4,6 (at the beginning of the project) to 3,64 (by the end of the project). The project has organized the distant grazing, developed the arrangements of seasonal use of the most productive remote pastures and the local community members have acquired the material resources (the yurt, generator and solar battery) for the further adaptation to the growing climate aridity on the project site. The project activities were supported by the akim of rural county by allotting the rangelands for the project activities. Said indicator has demonstrated that the project activities helped the local community members to overcome the obstacles on the local level that previously constrained the establishment of distant grazing: support of the akim; allotment of productive rangelands; infrastructure development at distant rangelands etc.</p> <p><u>Question 4:</u> While in 2008 the participants have given a low evaluation (score 1,2) of their capability to follow up the project activities after the project, in the mid-term evaluation the score was advanced (2,89) and reached 3,86 by the end of the project. The high evaluation of their capabilities and the willingness to follow up the project activities at the end of financing are explained by the local community members by the project results: the methods to mitigate the vulnerability to growing climate aridity have been shown; the remote high-productivity pastures have been allotted; the material assets such as yurt, pump, solar generator etc. have been purchased. Indicator 4 has demonstrated the increased confidence of the local community members in their capacity to run the traditional cattle farming based on the seasonal use of</p>			
--	--	--	--

<p>rangelands at the end of donor financing. The method to conduct the vulnerability reduction assessment workshops is rather convincing to show the project sustainability.</p>			
<p>Description of the voluntary contribution (capacities, knowledge, know-how, manual labor, materials, tools, etc.). Gender segregated data on communities engaged, opportunities and barriers to volunteerism, existing volunteerism activities before and after implementation of project.</p>	<p>The main stakeholder, Wiedergeburt Public Association, actively involved the staff members of the Forestry Management Office, rangers and schoolchildren in the project activities who planted haloxylon and maintained the seedlings on a volunteer basis. To work with the cattle owners Wiedergeburt engaged volunteers from Arai Youth Center to provide training for the local community members and arrange the distant grazing. The project encouraged the development of rural volunteer initiative.</p>		
<p>The results of the Impact Assessment System Indicators (Global Environmental Benefit focal areas + Livelihood and Empowerment)</p>	<p>The project verification against the indicators as set up in the project has shown a high efficiency of the project activities.</p> <p><u>The area (ha) of degraded lands recovered by the project:</u> 70ha of degraded lands have been restored by the project by planting haloxylon.</p> <p><u>Reduction of load limits:</u> For 2 years the project activities have ensured a 10% reduction of the load on the near-village pastures.</p> <p><u>The area (ha) of lands under sustainable management encouraged by the project:</u> The pattern of seasonal use of distant pastures Aitzhailau implemented on the coast of Lake Balkhash containing 4900ha located 20-25km from Mukan Tolebayev village for grazing of LC cattle.</p> <p><u>The number of technologies implemented:</u> Three technologies have been implemented by the project: revival of haloxylon forests; productivity enhancement of inundable hayfields and seasonal use of distant pastures.</p> <p><u>Improvement of the near-village pastoral foliage cover:</u> In 2010 the foliage cover of the near-village pastures was increased by 7%.</p> <p><u>Livelihood Enhancement:</u> <u>10-12% increase in live weight of cattle:</u> By the end of grazing period, the live weight of livestock grazed according to the project arrangements exceeded the same parameter of the animals grazed at the near-village pastures, notably 30kg/head of cattle and 9kg/head of small cattle.</p> <p>Due to the weight gains of cattle the income made by</p>		

	<p>the LC members involved in the project increased by 30%. <u>10% of inhabitants have access to the sustainable grassland cattle farming.</u> 12 households and 64 individuals are involved in the sustainable pastoral resources management under the project. Persons benefitted from the project: 22 women, 42 men and 48 children. <u>The number of NGO's/LC's involved in the project: 2 NGO's and 1 local community</u> of M. Tolebayev village have been involved in the project activities.</p>
<p>Describe the results of the Adaptation indicators measured during the project</p>	<p>The number of methods/approaches implemented that are focused on the mitigation of risks induced by the climate change and included as part of the activities on sustainable management of natural resources: 2 methods – restoration of haloxylon rangelands by planting haloxylon (covering 70ha) and enhancement of fodder base in inundable hayfields by fertilizer treatment</p> <p>The number of tested approaches on the natural resources sustainable management to improve the livelihood of local community and protect the resources: 1 method (sustainable use of pastures by means of distant grazing and fodder base enhancement)</p> <p>The agreement signed with the rural akim provided for the allotment of 4900ha of distant pastures to the local community (Aitzhailau site located 20-25km from the village). Since 2010 said rangelands have been sustainable managed by the local community.</p> <p>The number of participants (households) benefited from the activities of sustainable resources management: 12 households and 64 individuals making 13% of the village inhabitants.</p>
<p>Provide a Summary Paragraph on the above monitoring and evaluation activities</p>	<p>The project is a successful example of the proper selection of the technology for sustainable pastoral management in the desert zone of Kazakhstan under the growing climate aridity conditions. The local community members have realized the efficiency of the project: the productivity of cattle grazed on the remote high-productivity pastures has increased; the village inhabitants have more free time for the other</p>

	<p>activities. The improved yielding capacity of hayfields based on the method proposed by the project enables to extend the housing period of cattle maintenance and reduce the load on the near-village pastures thus protecting them from degradation. The project enabled to raise the livelihood of the village inhabitants under the growing climate aridity conditions.</p> <p>The project approach does not require high capital investment, is easily implemented and enables to become less dependent on the climate change.</p>
--	--

6.0 Project outcomes with respect to the following variables:

Objective 1: To test the new technologies on inundable hayfield management by accumulating moisture and improving their productivity for the purposes of cattle farming of the local community members through the increased yields of forage for winter and reduced cattle grazing.

The activities under Objective 1 have been accomplished with the following outcomes gained:

The use of mineral fertilizer (Output 1.1) and snow retention (Output 1.2) contributed to better adsorption of nitrogen and its accumulation in soil with moisture during the snow melting period in spring. The hay yields on the fertilizer-treated inundable pasture containing 20ha were 2,7 times higher compared to the same area of untreated land (Output 1.3). It has also been noted the high quality of yield harvested: the height of vegetation on the project inundable hayfield was 30cm higher. On the fertilizer treated inundable lands the after-grass was high enough to gaze the cattle until the snowfall period. The residual effect of such activity was noted in 2010: the grass stand was higher compared to the untreated inundable lands.

The local community members started developing the new pastoral lands whereby the grazing load on the near-village pastures was reduced by 10%.

The subsequent implementation of the activities under Objective 1 on the rational and proper inundable hayfields management will enable to improve the project aspects as follows:

- *Environmental:* conservation, natural restoration of ecosystems and biodiversity of hayfields and pastures thus addressing the problem of their desertification;
- *Social:* provision of rough forage to the cattle will involve the support of cattle farming thus making it more profitable. The process will encourage the enhancement of the local community's livelihood and poach reduction.

Objective 2: To enhance the pastoral sustainability by establishing haloxylon plantations under the growing aridization conditions.

One of the project activities was the awareness raising of local authorities and LC members of the climate change, climate-related risks and the methods to adapt to such risks. Due to the lack of budget funds and the knowledge, the akimat of M. Tolebayev village was not able to organize the radical improvement of pastoral lands and their rational and sustainable management under the growing aridity conditions.

The goals of Objective 2 were to demonstrate the adaptation approaches as follows: restoration of haloxylon forests to ensure the radical improvement of pastures; implementation of the seasonal grazing pattern on the remote pastures, productivity enhancement of inundable hayfields and development of the collaboration model for the akimat and LC members.

The activities under Objective have been successfully accomplished with the following outcomes gained:

- The akimat's and the LC's awareness raised of the climate change risks on the project site and the methods of vulnerability reduction of the local community;

- The agreement was reached and the contract was signed with the district akimat on the use of 4900ha of remote rangelands;
- The yielding capacity has been identified for the pastoral biomass of each seasonal site;
- The cattle stock has been estimated for each seasonal site in view of the pastoral yielding capacity, load limits and the climate change;
- In 2010 120 conventional heads of cattle owned by the local community have been driven to the remote pastures;
- The grazing load on the near-village was reduced by 10 %.

The positive effect of Objective 2: the model of collaboration has been developed for the local community members owning cattle and the akimat to allot the rangelands for the grazing needs of community-owned cattle in view of the climate change risks.

The activities under Objective 2.0 were also expanded through the grant funds provided by the Swiss Government: the equipment has been purchased for the distant pasture, the additional plantations of haloxylon have been made containing 10ha, and the areas of fertilizer-treated inundable hayfields have been expanded by 20ha.

Objective 3: Dissemination of the project experience to be replicated by the other local communities

The following outcomes have been gained under Objective 3:

- The project has developed and **for the first time ever**, starting from 2010, has been implementing the technology of seasonal use of pastures associated with the rural county by the cattle owners involved in the project. With the use of said technology the adverse grazing impacts on the soil and vegetation are minimized;
- In the period from May to October 2009 the meetings and the Field Day have been held on the inundable site maintained by E. Smerdina, the demonstrational workshop has been organized, two project monitoring exercises have been performed (25-26 July, 26-28 August with involvement of SGP GEF staff members and experts). The field-training workshop was held on 4-7 May with involvement of the Youth Club (25 persons). The participants were able to see the young crops of haloxylon, determine the percentage of germinating ability and identify a set of pest control measures;
- In the period from March to November 2010 the meetings, field trips, the demonstrational workshop have been held and the project monitoring has been performed by the UNDP and GTZ representatives;
- On 25 March 2011 the final demonstrational training workshop has been held in Taldykorgan with involvement of the local community members of M. Tolebayev village, SGP GEF representatives, Farmer of Kazakhstan Foundation representatives and Wiedergeburt PA;
- In March 2011 the brochure was prepared and published on the methods to improve the fertility of inundable hayfields and revival of haloxylon pastures;
- The project was accompanied by the experts' consultations and training of village inhabitants, herdsmen, representatives of local authorities, entrepreneurs, owners of pastoral lands, government authorities (district and oblast akimats), potential donors (international organizations and entrepreneurs) in the methods to respond to the climate change and the demonstration of the project outcomes attained;
- Five articles have been published in the district newspaper in Kazakh, 3 articles have been published in the republican magazines and newspapers and 2 articles have been placed on Internet).

The community has benefited from the more sustainable agricultural practices, the rational pastoral tenure and conservation of pastoral ecosystem productivity dependent on the climate change. The use of activities proposed by the project enabled to reduce such vulnerability and attain the sustainable traditional cattle farming implemented on the project site.

8.1. Organisational: Has this project impacted the organization?

Owing to the project Wiedergeburt (Revival) PA have enhanced their status both on the oblast and the national level as one of the leading non-governmental organizations in Kazakhstan in the field of rational use of natural resources.

8.2. Capacity Building: How were local capacities enhanced and how did it contribute to project success?

One of the conditions of the project activity was the existence of NGO within the local community. There is no NGO in M. Tolebayev village. So, the initiative group has been established. It needs to be noted that the initiative group has worked fruitfully being a pillar for the project activities in all its steps. The non-governmental organization, Arai Youth Center, from the neighboring village of Lepsy was involved to work with the local inhabitants and implement the project activities on seasonal pasture rotation. B. Shalov, the head of Arai Youth Center perfectly knows the situation and the inhabitants of M. Tolebayev village, has a good reputation among the village inhabitants and has successfully arranged the development of remote pastures. The experience gained and the work skills on the project development and preparation have contributed to the institutional development of the local community of M. Tolebayev village.

8.3. Poverty Reduction: How the project impacted poverty

The two years of project activities is a short period to see the poverty alleviation results. But it follows from the project outcomes that with the annual rotational seasonal grazing the rangelands will preserve their productivity and cattle productivity will increase. The live weight gains making 30-35kg per one head of cattle and 9-10kg per one head of small cattle enhanced the incomes of LC members involved in the project. Even within such a short period of time the profit made by the local community members from selling 1 head of cattle was US\$100 and small cattle – US\$30 respectively. Owing to the live weight gains the incomes of LC members involved in the project have raised by 30%.

8.4. Community Participation

Wiedergeburt (Revival) PA in collaboration with Arai Youth Center have made a lot of efforts to involve the local community in the project activities. The local community members took part in all the meetings at the stage of project preparation and implementation and enhanced their level of awareness and knowledge in the field of climate change and cattle farming adaptation by reestablishment of haloxylon pastures, enhancement of fertility of inundable hayfields and conservation of rangelands.

Wiedergeburt (Revival) PA and Arai NGO have performed a great pre-project awareness and advocacy work among the rural inhabitants (discussions, general meetings and workshops) concerning the climate change risks on the project site and the potential ways of cattle farming adaptation to those risks. Said work was actively performed at the stage of idea selection, development of activities and discussion of the involvement and input of each LC member in the project activity. The clearly formulated project activities, expected outcomes and benefits to be gained by each project participant contributed to the development of the sense of ownership in the project of each LC member. The overall project goal and objectives clear to the village inhabitants and the activities feasible for the project executing parties have united the local inhabitants and contributed to the project success.

Therefore, the project idea was positively perceived by the village people at the general meeting of the inhabitants and gained the full support and approval. The volunteer movement has emerged in the village: the local inhabitants started actively participating in the project monitoring, Field Days etc. The continuous monitoring by the local community members was one of the project's success factors.

8.5. Sustainable Livelihoods/Benefits

The climate change towards aridization increases the environmental risks. The main project idea – the sustainable local community development by implementing the new elements of water and land resources management mitigating the risks arising as a result of the growing climate aridity.

The material benefits gained by the project participants are mainly composed on the value of the livestock product made. The rotation of pastoral lands enhances the forage base and thus the productivity and quality of the livestock products. At the end of the project the grass-flesh cattle owned by the local community and grazed on seasonal rangelands was sold at the market price of no less than US\$900 per a head of cattle that is two times higher compared to the years before the project.

The interviews given by the village inhabitants at the workshop, in the video film and the workshops on the vulnerability reduction assessment demonstrate the enhancement of livelihood of the local community members involved in Haloxylon project. On top of that, in addition to the environmental benefits (improvement of the village environment), the transfer of cattle to the community herd released the free time, especially for women. Many of them were involved in the other activity and gained profits from processing the livestock products, sale, growing vegetables in the household gardens etc.

8.6. Project policy impact

The project outcomes and their presentation on various levels have already resulted in the state policy changes. The Ministry of Environmental Protection jointly with the UNDP have prepared the National Climate Change Adaptation Concept, where agriculture was emphasized as the most vulnerable sector. The Concept Paper encloses the list of the best adaptation practices implemented in Kazakhstan and recommended for replication. The project in question was also included in said list.

The project along with the number of other projects implemented by GEF SGP in the field of sustainable pastoral resources management have drawn the attention of the RK Ministry of Agriculture and laid the basis for the Kazakhstan's national pasture restoration program being currently under development.

It is necessary to mention a number of challenges encountered by the project that require the steps to be taken on the governmental level.

The gaps in the land legislation and the absence of law on pastures give rise to the conflicts when allotting and using the pastoral lands. No any agency deals with the monitoring of pastoral conditions and control over the rational use of pastures. The governmental support of stock-water development at the distant pastures, infrastructure development of the distant pastures and development of cattle routes has fully been stopped.

The lack of governmental support for the pastoral cattle farming results in the shrinkage of the flooded pastures and overgrazing of the flooded and near-village rangelands. The lack of infrastructure at the remote rangelands makes the herdsmen's work unattractive for young people. The above reasons as well as the lack of training courses result in the deficit of experienced herdsmen and cattle farmers.

8.7. Sustainability Plan

The project includes the sustainability activities that have been accomplished. The agreement was signed with the rural akim on the long-term use of remote pastures to establish the seasonal pasture rotation and graze cattle owned by the local community of M. Tolebayev village. The establishment of partnership relations and support of the project on the part of the local executive authorities (rural and district akimats); public organizations (Wiedergeburt (Revival) PA, Farmer of Kazakhstan Foundation, Arai Youth Center PA) are of great significance to the project sustainability.

8.8. Financing and Co-financing

The project has gained a grant support under Community-based Adaptation Program amounting to 50,000 (including the planned grant of US\$2000). In addition, owing to co-financing of the Swiss Government in the amount

of US\$10000 the project has expanded its activities. The grant has contributed to strengthening the basic infrastructure at the distant pastures (purchase of yurt, purchase of water dispensing tank for drinking water, saddles and snaffles etc.).

The input of project participants and GIZ was US\$164010.

8.9. Replication: Is this project suitable for replication in other communities or regions. Plans or what has taken place in this regard

To disseminate the project experience the activities and outcomes were broadly covered by mass media and through the show of video films and writing the articles etc.

The main pastoral territories of Kazakhstan located in the semi-desert and desert zones and covering the area of 31 million ha are rather vulnerable not only to the man-induced pressure but also to the climate change risks: elevation of temperature, intensified draughts, impacts of the dry hot winds and changes in the precipitation pattern. The loss of traditional knowledge, the lack of methodologies and arrangements of the rational pastoral utilization in the light of the ongoing climate changes have resulted in the degradation of pastures and reduction of wellbeing of rural inhabitants. The project approach i.e. restoration of the traditional seasonal use of pastures, radical improvement of rangelands by restoring the haloxylon pastures and enhancement of the hayfield productivity is rather demanded in many areas of the country.

The project outcomes have become attractive to the neighboring villages which inhabitants are also engaged in the grazing cattle farming. The training process for cattle breeders in the measures to respond to the adverse climate change processes is under way on the basis of the project.

8.10. Gender Mainstreaming:

The project was focused on both the interests of men and women. None of the target groups were exposed to any violation of rights. Women took part in the discussion of project ideas and monitoring. In addition, it needs to be noted that the component on the improvement of fodder capacity of inundable hayfields was fully executed under the supervision and with direct involvement of Yekaterina Smerdina, Head of Smerdin LLP.

8.11 Were all the objectives achieved? If not, what were the challenges related to the objectives not achieved?

All the project objectives have been fully accomplished and all the project outcomes have been achieved.

8.12 How did the project contribute to the outcomes and impact identified in the Country Programme Strategy?

The project helped to implement though simple but innovative adaptation approach on the local community level: it enabled to efficiently use the land resources (establish the sustainable pastoral management) and water resources (the use of available water resources to irrigate the lands and develop the inundable hayfields for the purposes of the fodder base formation). The project has made its contribution to the achievement of the goals set forth in the Adaptation Strategy: implementation and promotion of the methods (experiences) focused on the vulnerability reduction of the local inhabitants to the climate changes and adapting the agricultural sector to the climate change.

9.0. Other Lessons learned not captured in section/part 6 above:

7.0 Annexes and other relevant documentation (could be sent if required)

8.0 Final comments by the Evaluator/Grantee/Individual filling the evaluation template

9.0 Digital photographs taken during the evaluation/appraisal with title to be attached here:
The activities implemented under the project enable the community to adapt under the changing climate conditions and along with that a sufficient forage base is provided improving the quality of cattle and the incomes of the local community members. The experience gained within the project may help the communities of the other villages to apply the simple and highly efficient agricultural methods adapted to the growing climate aridity.

Name of Person Compiling Report:
Vladimir Levin

Signature:

Evaluation/Appraisal Date or Period: July 2011

Date Evaluation/Appraisal Report was submitted:

October 2011